



Response to request for additional information following the representation raised by consultants on behalf of the occupiers of East Lilling Grange. Amended 3rd October 2020 Amended 16th November 2020.

Building position amended to comply with the request of East Lilling Grange Consultants.

1. Time line for Commercial Equestrian use at East Lilling Grange Farm

1989

Peter and Pauline Simmons owned East Lilling Grange, the farm land and the adjacent buildings now East Lilling Grange Farm
12 horses were kept on site as Hunter Liveries, with Peter also buying young horses, bringing them on, and selling those same horses as a commercial enterprise.

1993

Peter and Pauline sold East Lilling Grange and moved into East Lilling Farm, the converted adjacent buildings.
The horses were moved into the existing barns on site and the commercial equestrian business continued.

1996

Heidi, daughter to Peter and Pauline joined the equestrian business and started teaching riders from the farm and schooling the young horses for sale. The work was carried out under ELGF the equestrian business. Number of horses around 15.

2003

Dressage Arena approved and built to facilitate the teaching and schooling of horses for both Heidi and Ian Woodhead who was now training from the Equestrian small holding. Horse numbers vary up to 17 with some horses permanently outside.

2006

All the work was brought under the umbrella of DHI Event Horses Ltd. Heidi and Ian were married.
Both Heidi and Ian teaching and bringing on young horses for sale or competition. Ian training international riders and International event teams. Peter working alongside. Horse numbers around 20 with some horses permanently outside.

2010

Horse Walker approved and built to allow horse exercising facilities essential for the equestrian business
DHI Event Horses continue with same format and horse numbers. Facility has greater use by International riders.

2016

Additional stabling approved but not built

DHI Event Horses continue with same format and similar horse numbers around 20 but additional horses up to 20 owned and kept outside the UK.

The training of international riders and International Teams continues.

2017

Additional stabling approved in a new lean to building adjoining the existing stabling. Built and occupied.

Horse stabling now on site for 20 horses.

DHI Event Horses continue with same format and horse numbers.

2020

DHI Event Horses continue with same format and horse numbers

2. Clarification on Horse numbers

Presently the Equestrian Business that is East Lilling Grange Farm has between 15 and 20 horse on site, numbers vary as horses are sold or purchased. Horses are also stabled during extended teaching or training. Horses are also owned and kept outside the UK, from 10 to 20 horses at any one time.

The increase of international teaching and training together with the need to isolate before competitions is the requirement for the new isolation stabling.

It is anticipated that the new isolation stable barn will have around 60% occupancy as riders and teams come and go using the facility and the facility is cleaned between each occupancy.

So in general terms an increase on average of around 7 to 8 additional horses can be expected on the premises.

3. Alternative Sites for the New Isolation Barn and setting of The Listed Building

The consultants on behalf of the occupiers of East Lilling Grange have suggested an alternative location that would be acceptable to the owners of East Lilling Grange.

This alternative site has been considered by ourselves and whilst not being ideal from a user point of, we are happy to accommodate the wishes of the neighbours and have drawn up plans to accommodate a re-designed building moved further north by some 33m so as the southern end of the new building is level with the southern end of the existing stable block, in this position the building cannot be looked upon by East Lilling Grange as it will be completely hidden by the existing buildings. Added to this

we have also suggested some hedge and tree planting to further screen the south gable elevation D.

The northern end of the building has a 4m overhang essential for the normal day to day use of the building, it allows riders to dismount under cover and remove tack from the horses before entering the building. It also allows horses and riders an area outside but sheltered from the elements prior to lessons commencing. Lighting to this area will be discreet and low level.

The neighbours consultants queried the need for the southern door. The southern end of the building requires access for emergency use and for access to the feed store so access and use will be very limited at this southern access but essential from an emergency point of view. Horse and riders will only use the northern entrance.

We would also be happy to help with improvements to make this revised location and the building more acceptable as suggested by East Lilling Grange consultants.

These include removing the hit and miss Yorkshire boarding and replacing it with solid timber boarding, further lowering the height of the building with the ridge at 4.6m above ground level, evergreen screening and an extended acoustic fence on the boundary with the Listed Building.

These improvements are listed in our Summary at the end of this response.

The reduced height barn in this revised position will ensure that the building will not be seen from the Listed Building, as it will be hidden by the existing buildings and the existing mature hedge and tree boundary. As agreed this mature hedge and tree boundary will be reinforced with additional evergreen planting and an acoustic fence to further ensure total privacy and no sound nuisance from what anyway is a very quiet equestrian use.

Ryedale's Conservation Officer has confirmed that in her opinion our revised position does not harm the Listed Building or its setting.

4. Noise pollution and new planting

Horses by way of their very nature are quiet animals, they themselves do not create any noise at all that would be heard outside the new barn. The cleaning of the stables is undertaken by the stable staff and again is a quiet operation with virtually no noise created. The stable building will be fitted with rubber carpets that will deaden the sound of horses moving around the building.

Thus the background noise levels generally would be at a low level with conversations between grooms and competitors being part of a low level background noise.

The stable routine and management systems are of the highest quality, the use of radios playing music by the staff is not allowed.

The evergreen planting and strengthened planting will also help to absorb and soften these low level background noise levels. Additionally as requested we are happy to provide additional tree planting T1 to T5 inside the existing hawthorn hedge to the east of the proposed building. Indigenous tree species to be agreed.

Removing windows and rooflights in the Eastern elevation will also help lesson any noise transfer or leakage from the new isolation building.

We are happy to provide an acoustic Sound Reflecting Fence to the eastern boundary with East Lilling Grange. The extent of this is shown on the site block plan dhl 4 a/b/c Nov 20 and the design on plan dhl 3A a/b Nov 20. I also attach particulars from JCW Acoustic Supplies, on such a Sound Reflective Acoustic Screen Fence. This will be the fence type used and the decibel reductions are shown.

Moving the horses to and from the horse boxes and into the surrounding exercise areas is on hardcore or grass with no metallated surfaces, at walking pace, so even these movements are limited in terms of noise created.

Vehicles coming into the Equestrian yard are, by nature of the narrow drive and bends, moving at very slow speeds of around 5 to 10mph so again noise levels are low. Grooms are always very careful at lowering ramps gently as horses need to be kept calm in these situations.

However in an effort to help with this situation it is proposed that vehicles including horse boxes will access and egress the site by the hardcored area at the northern end of the dressage arena, they would then proceed around the arena on the hardcored access and park on the new hardcored area some considerable distance from the East Lilling Grange House, ensuring that vehicle noise levels both from the present use and future use are reduced and kept to a minimum.

A visit to the site underlines how quiet an equestrian operation this is with noise levels only those one would expect in a quiet countryside environment..

5. Light Pollution

We are happy to comply with any requirements that may help in this respect and will have a lighting scheme designed to minimise pollution for approval prior to work starting on site. Any external and internal lights can be low in lumens and positioned so as to direct the light downwards but at a low level, thus reducing vertical light spillage.

This lighting scheme both externally and internally can be designed and installed in accordance with reference to The Guidance Notes for the Reduction of Light Pollution drawn up by The Institute of Lighting Engineers.

The new position for the building ensures no light pollution towards the listed building. All glazing will be fitted with light pollution preventing films.

It should be noted that stable work finishes at 5pm with no need for lighting either inside or outside the buildings after this time other than if an emergency required it.

Most days of the year internal artificial light would not be required throughout the working day.

The roof lights will be translucent sheets that are opaque and limit light transfer. The small side windows can have a tinted film to also limit light transfer.

6. Hardstandings and Access

The attached site plan shows the proposed new hardstanding's and proposed new vehicular access arrangements.

These have been designed in an effort to help mitigate any noise or nuisance caused by traffic movements into the site.

It is proposed that vehicles including horse boxes will access and egress the site by the hardcored area at the northern end of the dressage arena, they would then proceed around the arena on the hardcored access and park on the new hardcored area some considerable distance from the East Lilling Grange House, ensuring that vehicle noise levels both from the present use and future use are reduced and kept to a minimum.

Vehicles are thus kept at a much greater distance from East Lilling Grange than at present.

A point has been raised re a possible passing place for horse boxes and other vehicles on the private drive before the drive discharges onto the main road. We have indicated on the attached plans where this might be located and are happy to provide this facility.

7. Surface Water

The Internal drainage Board requires that surface water runoff is restricted. To comply with these requirements surface water run-off will be kept to current field run off levels or as required by the IDB with surface water from the proposed building going through an attenuation system designed for that purpose before discharging into the current culverts on site. The proposed building will gather its surface water into a soakaway system via attenuation in the form of an extended wrapped perforated pipe

system. This system will be designed following percolation tests to meet the IDB requirements and installed accordingly with their approval.

The proposed and existing hardcore areas on site will be constructed of a granite chipping/gravel or a loose road planning's surface above clean hardcore, forming a porous construction. This will ensure that the surface water percolates naturally to the ground beneath with normal agricultural runoff rates remaining unchanged.

8. Manure Management with additional information added

Horse manure is in a virtually dry solid form and has little smell when stored and dealt with correctly. The horses are kept on dry shavings.

The management plan at East Lilling Grange Farm has been successfully in place for over ten years, and is as follows:

The stables are cleaned out on a daily basis by hand, and the removed waste is taken to the concrete bunded muck heap, using wheel barrows with rubber tyres.

There is also a field manure management plan, whereby, manure is removed on a daily basis, by hand and taken to the muck heap, to ensure no polluting of the land.

The housing for the waste manure is over 2m in height, constructed of concrete panels on three sides, these panels are sealed to the concrete base to ensure the manure is contained within the bunded enclosure at all times

Once a week, the waste manure is pushed up to the rear of the enclosure, which takes approximately ten minutes. This is to ensure that all the manure remains within the concrete bund walls.

The muck heap is inspected on a daily basis by DHI Event Horses senior site manager.

When the muck heap is approximately 75% full, the waste is collected and removed by a local farm within a couple of days, This ensures the cleanliness of the muck heap is maintained with no odours or smells.

Presently the dry horse manure within the muck heap is moved every 6 to 8 weeks by Whitestone Farms who use it on their land as manure. With the increase in horses it is intended that this process will take place every 4 to 6 weeks or as required.

When the waste has been removed, the concrete housing is thoroughly swept and cleaned down which allows regular inspection of the sealed unit, thus ensuring its continued effectiveness.

The process then begins again.

Following thorough research and advice from DEFRA, in line with the Environmental Permitting (England and Wales) Regulations 2016, and as there have been no complaints or comments regarding this management process, it would substantiate that this is a successful ongoing plan.

Should any complaints be received, they would be recorded in a log, detailing the nature of the complaint, the findings of the investigation, and what action would need to be taken to rectify the situation.

References:

Environmental Permitting (England and Wales) Regulations (2016)
Manure Storage & Disposal Advice Note (007) - Horse Pasture Management Project - Simpson, R. (2009)
BHS Guide to Grassland Management for Horse & Pony Owners - British Horse Society (2001)
Protecting our water, soil and air: a code of good agricultural practice for farmers, growers and land managers - Defra and Natural England (2018)
Horses, Grasslands & Nature Conversation IN52 - Natural England (2011)

9. Operating Hours

The normal day is from 7.30am to 5.00pm. seven days a week but with limited work on a Sunday. The last check on horses being 5pm in the evening each day but it is limited to just one person doing a walk round inspection.

Eventing competitions are always throughout the day, they can last from one to three days. Early morning starts are sometimes required to get to the event destination that morning, though they are not the norm, but with the vehicle park now distant to the dwellings noise levels would be very low.

Peter and his wife Pauline are closer to the Horse Box park and are not at all disturbed by the occasional quiet early morning starts.

Generally the international competitors are competing at three day events where they would arrive two days in advance so early starts are not required.

10 Temporary Stabling

My clients have had to erect the temporary stabling previously discussed as the weather has started to deteriorate towards winter and the thoroughbred horses need to be in doors in the wet and cold conditions.

These stables are very much a temporary solution to be removed as soon as the planning application for the permanent isolation barn is resolved.

Summary of Changes and Proposals to address the issues raised and to work with the neighbours at East Lilling Grange and their Consultants.

1. Reduce the bulk of the building and the overall height of the ridge to 4.6m.
2. Reduce the numbers of windows and rooflights and fit them within the construction bays. Rooflights to be translucent opaque sheets and glass to have a tinted film to prevent light transfer.
3. Reposition the reduced height building to the position suggested by East Lilling Grange Consultants further from the listed building and with no direct line of sight to the stables from the listed building. The stables will not be seen from the listed building.
4. Change the Yorkshire boarding to solid timber cladding to all walls.
5. Design the lighting requirements internally and externally to limit light pollution.
6. Provide additional evergreen planting to the boundary between the site and The Listed Building to provide all year round screening and secure the setting of the listed building.
7. Erect a sound absorbing/reflective acoustic fence between the site and the listed building.
8. Change the route for vehicles accessing and egressing the site and form a new hardstanding for vehicle parking further away from the Listed Building. To help generally but also to reduce vehicle noise levels.
9. Provide a vehicle passing place at the point of discharge on to the public highway to aid the safe use of this access.
10. A designed surface water attenuation system to IDB requirements will be installed.

We are grateful for the sensible proposals offered by the neighbours at East Lilling Grange and their Consultants and delighted that we are able to go some way to addressing their concerns.

We feel that the modified proposals now will have no impact upon the owners of East Lilling Grange either visually or from a sound, light or odour issue and look forward to moving forward.